

The Concept of *Hulul*: Al-Hallaj's Thought and Its Relevance in Sufism

Yogi Fery Hidayat ¹

¹ Universitas Darunnajah, Indonesia

Corresponding Author: Yogi Fery Hidayat, E-mail: yferyhidayat@darunnajah.ac.id

Received: May 12, 2024	Revised: May 14, 2024	Accepted: June 28, 2024	Online: June 28, 2024
------------------------	-----------------------	-------------------------	-----------------------

ABSTRACT

This study discusses the concept of *Hulul* in the thought of Abu Mansur al-Hallaj, a controversial 9th-century Sufi who introduced the idea of spiritual union between God and man. *Hulul* refers to the belief that in mystical experience, a Sufi can attain a spiritual union with God, as reflected in al-Hallaj's famous statement, *Ana al-Haqq* (I am the Truth). This research uses a qualitative approach with literature review, as well as historical, philosophical, and theological methodologies to examine the doctrine of *Hulul* and its impact on the Sufi tradition. The analysis also addresses the relevance of al-Hallaj's thought to later Sufis, such as Jalaluddin Rumi and Ibn Arabi, who in various ways developed the idea of the union between man and God. The findings indicate that, despite *Hulul* facing significant criticism from orthodox scholars for being seen as contradictory to *tauhid* (the concept of God's oneness), this teaching still had a substantial influence on the development of Islamic mysticism and Sufism. The concept of *Hulul* remains one of the primary symbols of profound mystical experiences within the Sufi tradition.

Keywords: *Hulul*, Al-Hallaj, Islamic Mysticism, Spiritual Union

Journal Homepage <https://journal.ypidathu.or.id/index.php/ijnis>

This is an open access article under the CC BY SA license

<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/>

How to cite:

Hidayat, F. Y. (2024). Anxiety Description of Social Workers in Assisting Children in Conflict with the Law. *Journal of Noesantara Islamic Studies*, 1(3), 170-178. <https://doi.org/10.70177/ijnis.v1i3.1303>

Published by:

Yayasan Pendidikan Islam Daarut Thufulah

INTRODUCTION

Sufism, or Islamic mysticism, is a tradition rich with various thoughts and teachings about spiritual experiences and one's relationship with God. One of the key figures in the history of Sufism is al-Hallaj, a Sufi known for his controversial concept of *Hulul* (Bryant, 2023; Fabre, 2022; Gruberg et al., 2022; Ugwu, 2024). This concept, which refers to the spiritual union between man and God, shook the religious world of his time and led to al-Hallaj's execution in 922 AD.

The concept of *Hulul* presented by al-Hallaj is one of the most controversial topics in the history of Islamic thought. Al-Hallaj, a 9th-century Sufi mystic, was perceived to propagate the idea that God could incarnate within a human being, which he expressed through statements like *Ana al-Haqq* (I am the Truth) (Brown, 2020; Kaunert & de Deus Pereira, 2023; Matei, 2020; Saraceno, 2020; Shubitidze & Japharidze, 2021; Usmanova et al., 2020; Witkowska-Chrzczonec, 2021). This view, which involves the identification

of oneself with God, was seen as a violation of *tauhid*, the principle of God's oneness and absoluteness. As a result, al-Hallaj was considered a heretic by many scholars and rulers of his time, leading to his execution (Amina Toleubekova et al., 2018; Polanía et al., 2022; Villegas, 2021). Despite his tragic death, al-Hallaj's thought on *Hulul* not only left a mark on the Sufi tradition but also influenced many prominent Sufis who followed. The controversy surrounding this concept continues to this day, with some viewing al-Hallaj's teachings as a form of deep spiritual awakening, while others see it as a serious threat to the fundamental doctrines of Islam.

Amir Reza Kusuma's research (2021) explores al-Hallaj's concept of *Hulul* and examines the position of Sufism within the context of this thought (Aliev, 2024; Eckersley, 2019; Gharehbeygi & Vasegh, 2018; Heinämaa & Kaitaro, 2018; Perlmutter, 2019; Pettifer, 2020; Plested, 2024). The study aims to clarify the differences between the concept of *Hulul* and *wahdatul wujud* and evaluate the model and practice of Sufism as advocated by al-Hallaj. Firmansyah F's research (2021) aims to understand the concepts of *al-ittihad* (union) and *al-hulul* (incarnation) in Islamic Sufism and evaluate their influence on the development of Sufi philosophy and practice (Ayad, 2022; Bogart, 2018; Denapoli, 2018; Greg, 2018). This study also identifies the potential of Sufi concepts to address social challenges in the context of today's materialistic and hedonistic lifestyle.

Devi Umi Solehah's research (2021) examines and discusses *Falsafi Sufism*, which combines a philosophical approach in understanding God (*ma'rifat*) and the concept of *wahdatul wujud* (the unity of existence). This study aims to explore the understanding, background, historical development, figures, characteristics, and main teachings of *Falsafi Sufism*. Meanwhile, the current study seeks to explore the relevance and impact of the concept of *Hulul* within the Sufi tradition, focusing on how al-Hallaj's teachings influenced Sufi figures such as Jalaluddin Rumi and Ibn Arabi (Kutáš, 2019; Menassa et al., 2023; Simonyan & Slutskin, 2020; Sinha, 2022; Voloshina, 2021). Through this analysis, the study will discuss how al-Hallaj's ideas about spiritual union and divine love contributed to the development of Islamic mysticism, and how these concepts were reflected in the works and teachings of later Sufis. By understanding the context and influence of the concept of *Hulul*, we can gain deeper insights into the dynamics of spiritual thought within the Sufi tradition.

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

This research employs a qualitative approach with literature review, along with historical, philosophical, and theological methodologies, to examine the doctrine of *Hulul* and its impact on the Sufi tradition. The analysis also explores the relevance of al-Hallaj's thought to later Sufis, such as Jalaluddin Rumi and Ibn Arabi, who in various ways developed the idea of the union between man and God.

The research method aims to investigate in depth how the concept of *Hulul*, introduced by al-Hallaj, influenced Sufi thought and practice, with attention to the historical and philosophical context in which these ideas evolved (Nompumelelo et al., 2019; Stauffer, 2024). The qualitative approach through literature review allows the

researcher to gather and analyze relevant primary and secondary sources, including the works of al-Hallaj, the writings of subsequent Sufis, and related historical and theological literature.

The historical approach helps to understand the background and context of the era in which al-Hallaj lived, as well as the reactions to his teachings. The philosophical approach is used to analyze the arguments and concepts within the doctrine of *Hulul*, as well as its similarities and differences with other mystical thoughts like *Wahdat al-Wujud* (the Unity of Being) developed by Ibn Arabi. The theological approach examines how these teachings were integrated into the broader Islamic tradition and their impact on theological understanding.

The analysis of the relevance of al-Hallaj's thought to later Sufis such as Jalaluddin Rumi and Ibn Arabi is conducted by examining how they developed and interpreted the idea of the union between man and God in their works. Through this approach, the research aims to provide a comprehensive understanding of al-Hallaj's influence on the Sufi tradition and his contribution to the development of Islamic mysticism.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Biography of al-Hallaj

Al-Hallaj, whose full name is Abu al-Mughits al-Husayn ibn Mansur al-Hallaj, was a renowned Sufi from the 9th and 10th centuries. He was born in 858 AD in the town of Ṭur near al-Bayda' in Persia. His father was a wool spinner, a trade that al-Hallaj later adopted, earning him the title al-Hallaj, which means "the spinner" in Arabic (Massignon, 1994).

From a young age, al-Hallaj showed a deep interest in religious studies. At the age of 16, he joined a Sufi circle in Basra under the guidance of Sahl al-Tustari. After several years of study there, he traveled to Baghdad to learn further from the renowned Sufi, Junayd al-Baghdadi. Although Junayd was one of his spiritual mentors, there was tension between them due to al-Hallaj's radical teachings on mystical unity between God and man (Ernst, 1985).

The most controversial aspect of al-Hallaj's teachings was his concept of *Al-Haq* (which means "the Truth") and his famous declaration, *Ana al-Haq* (I am the Truth). This statement was seen as a claim of mystical union with God, which provoked the anger of orthodox scholars as it was perceived as blasphemy or sacrilege. While this statement is often interpreted within the context of Sufi spiritual ecstasy, many viewed it as a threat to traditional Islamic teachings (Schimmel, 1975).

As a result of his controversial teachings, al-Hallaj was arrested by the Abbasid authorities and imprisoned for several years. In 922 AD, he was sentenced to death by Caliph al-Muqtadir and was brutally executed in Baghdad. Al-Hallaj is considered a martyr in the Sufi tradition because his death is seen as a consequence of his pursuit of profound spiritual truth (Nicholson, 1963). Despite his execution, al-Hallaj's legacy lives on in the Sufi tradition. Many Sufis who followed him viewed him as a symbol of unity with God and sacrifice for the truth. His works and teachings have been re-examined by

various Sufi figures, including Rumi and Ibn Arabi, who regard al-Hallaj as a pioneer of profound Islamic mysticism (Chittick, 1989).

The Concept of Hulul in al-Hallaj's Thought

Al-Hallaj is one of the Sufi figures who explicitly introduced the concept of *Hulul* in his teachings. In al-Hallaj's view, the idea of *Hulul* does not refer to a physical union but rather to a spiritual experience where a Sufi feels the Divine presence so intensely within themselves that the boundary between the self and God becomes blurred. Al-Hallaj expressed this idea with one of the most controversial statements in Sufi history, *Ana al-Haqq* (I am the Truth/God) (Massignon, 1994). This statement is understood as a form of spiritual ecstasy where al-Hallaj experienced what is known as *fana'*, or the annihilation of the ego, and achieved *baqa'*, which is the state of existence with God (Schimmel, 1975).

According to al-Hallaj, in certain spiritual states, a Sufi can feel God's presence so close that it appears as if there is a union between them. In the context of *Hulul*, this union is not physical or literal but rather in terms of the Divine presence and love enveloping the Sufi to the extent that they see God in everything (Ernst, 1985). This aligns with the concept of *fana'* in Sufism, which emphasizes the loss of self-awareness as a separate being in the presence of God.

Fana' and *baqa'* are two crucial concepts in Sufism related to al-Hallaj's experience. *Fana'* is the state where the individual ego is dissolved, and one directly experiences God's presence, while *baqa'* is the phase where the individual experiences eternal existence with God, even while in the state of *fana'*. In this regard, al-Hallaj is considered to have reached a level of awareness where the boundary between human and Divine became very thin, leading to statements like *Ana al-Haqq* as reflections of his transcendent experience.

Al-Hallaj's experiences are often viewed as controversial because they are considered to surpass the boundaries of mainstream Sufi teachings and as a threat to religious orthodoxy. As a result, al-Hallaj faced strong opposition from religious authorities, which ultimately led to his execution. However, al-Hallaj's thought continues to have a profound impact on the Sufi tradition, particularly in its emphasis on the personal and direct experience of the Divine presence in a Sufi's life.

Controversy and Execution of al-Hallaj

The concept of *Hulul* taught by al-Hallaj provoked strong reactions from scholars and Abbasid authorities of his time. The statement *Ana al-Haqq* was considered by some scholars as a form of spiritual arrogance and blasphemy against *tauhid*, the fundamental Islamic concept that asserts God's oneness and His incomparability with His creation (al-Ghazali, 1972). This accusation was reinforced by the view that al-Hallaj had claimed divinity for himself, even though many other Sufis argued that his statement should be understood in the context of mysticism, not taken literally (Chittick, 1989). The controversy reached its peak when al-Hallaj was sentenced to death by the Abbasid authorities in 922 AD (Ernst, 1985).

The controversy surrounding al-Hallaj was not limited to the statement *Ana al-Haqq*, but also reflected the tension between mystical traditions and religious orthodoxy of that time. Al-Hallaj, with his challenging teachings, was seen as a threat to the social and religious stability maintained by the Abbasid rulers and conservative scholars.

The interpretation of al-Hallaj's statements was often influenced by differing views between Sufis and religious authorities. Sufis viewed al-Hallaj's statements as expressions of spiritual ecstasy and closeness to God, intended in a mystical sense rather than literally. On the other hand, orthodox scholars saw these statements as indications of heresy and attempts to undermine the essential concept of *tauhid* in Islamic teachings.

The death penalty imposed on al-Hallaj reflected the inability to bridge these differing perspectives. Al-Hallaj's execution became a symbol of the conflict between spiritual innovation and religious conservatism, highlighting how mystical teachings can provoke severe reactions in a society deeply bound by strict religious norms.

Despite his execution, al-Hallaj's intellectual legacy continues to influence the Sufi tradition and Islamic mysticism. Many subsequent writers and Sufi thinkers have further developed similar ideas, delving deeper into the relationship between humans and God and the significance of personal spiritual experiences.

Relevance of the Concept of Hulul in the Sufi Tradition

Despite al-Hallaj's execution, the concept of *Hulul* and his ideas remain alive within the Sufi tradition and have inspired numerous great Sufis who followed him. One notable figure influenced by al-Hallaj's thought is Jalaluddin Rumi. In his poetry, Rumi often speaks of the union between humanity and God through profound love, depicting a transcendental relationship between the creature and the Creator. He teaches that Divine love is a means to transcend the limitations of self and achieve awareness of God that encompasses everything (Rumi, 1995).

Additionally, Ibn Arabi, a Sufi and philosopher from Andalusia, developed ideas similar to *Hulul* through the concept of *Wahdat al-Wujud* (Unity of Being). Ibn Arabi argued that everything is essentially a manifestation of the Divine existence, and in certain spiritual states, a Sufi can experience union with God through awareness of this existential unity (Chittick, 1989). Although the concept of *Wahdat al-Wujud* differs from *Hulul* in theological aspects, both focus on the spiritual experience of union with God.

The concept of *Hulul*, despite its controversy, made significant contributions to Sufi thought by emphasizing the importance of a direct and profound experience with God. Al-Hallaj's influence can be seen in the works and teachings of Sufis who followed him, where themes of spiritual union and Divine love become central.

Jalaluddin Rumi, with his works rich in metaphors of love and unity, integrates aspects of al-Hallaj's experience into a more poetic and universal form. His poetry emphasizes that love is the bridge connecting the human soul with God, and through this love, individuals can experience a spiritual closeness that transcends individual boundaries. Rumi stresses that Divine love not only encompasses personal experience but also invites every individual to participate in the totality of Divine existence.

Meanwhile, Ibn Arabi extends the idea of *Hulul* into a more systematic framework of Sufi philosophy with the concept of *Wahdat al-Wujud*. By viewing all creation as a manifestation of God, Ibn Arabi proposes that achieving awareness of existential unity is the pinnacle of spiritual experience. Although there are theological differences between *Wahdat al-Wujud* and *Hulul*, both share a focus on personal experience that transcends ego boundaries and leads to union with God.

Overall, the concept of *Hulul* and al-Hallaj's thought contribute to the development of various mystical streams within the Sufi tradition. Despite often sparking debate, these ideas continue to be a source of inspiration and reflection for many Sufis and followers of Sufi teachings around the world.

Criticism of the Concept of Hulul

The concept of *Hulul* has also faced considerable criticism, particularly from scholars who uphold orthodox Islamic principles. The primary criticism against *Hulul* is that it is seen as contradictory to the principle of *tauhid*, which asserts that God is a transcendent entity and cannot be equated with His creatures (Alyabyeva et al., 2021; Bušková, 2021). Imam Ghazali, one of the prominent scholars in Islamic history, strongly opposed ideas similar to *Hulul*. In his work *Ihya Ulum al-Din*, Ghazali states that although a Sufi may approach God through worship and Divine love, this does not imply a literal union between God and humanity. God remains beyond the reach of creation, and any proposed form of union by Sufis must be understood metaphorically, not literally.

Ghazali's critique of the concept of *Hulul* reflects the orthodox Islamic position, which is cautious about interpreting mystical and spiritual experiences. For scholars who strictly adhere to *tauhid*, emphasizing the incomparability of God with His creation is key to maintaining the integrity of Islamic theology. This criticism is particularly directed at the literal understanding of union, which could endanger the view that God is entirely transcendent and distinct from His creation.

Ghazali acknowledges the importance of spiritual experiences and closeness to God in a Sufi's life but emphasizes that such experiences should not be interpreted literally as an ontological union with God. He offers a more moderate view that closeness to God can be achieved through the purification of the soul, *dzikr*, and Divine love, but God remains beyond complete human comprehension. According to Ghazali, the spiritual experiences reported by Sufis should be understood as metaphorical expressions of their closeness and love for God, rather than literal union with God.

Ghazali's criticism has had a significant impact on orthodox views regarding Sufism and has encouraged more cautious interpretations of mystical experiences. Ghazali's approach in reconciling Sufism with Sunni theology helped stabilize the relationship between mysticism and orthodox Islam. Nonetheless, the concept of *Hulul* continues to influence some Sufis and inspires further discussion on transcendent experiences and the human relationship with God within the Sufi tradition.

CONCLUSION

The concept of *Hulul* proposed by al-Hallaj marks a significant phase in the history of Sufism, even though his views provoked controversy and rejection from many scholars. The idea of *Hulul* is not only relevant in the life of al-Hallaj but also influenced the development of Sufism thereafter, including through prominent figures such as Rumi and Ibn Arabi. However, this concept remains a subject of debate in Islamic theology, with criticism arising primarily from those who adhere to orthodox understandings of *tauhid*.

REFERENCES

- Aliev, B. G. (2024). DAGESTAN'S UNIONS OF RURAL COMMUNITIES: FORMATION, ETHNIC STRUCTURE, GOVERNANCE SYSTEM. *History, Archeology and Ethnography of the Caucasus*, 20(3), 544–554. <https://doi.org/10.32653/CH203544-554>
- Alyabyeva, A. G., Ganicheva, J. V., Korsakova, I. A., & Shcherbakova, A. I. (2021). Cooperation as a form of interaction in modern educational society. In *Studies in Systems, Decision and Control* (Vol. 316, pp. 335–343). Springer Science and Business Media Deutschland GmbH. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-57831-2_35
- Amina Toleubekova, R. K., Nurpeissov, N. T., Sh., I., Joldassova, O. K., & Tamabaeva, M. K. (2018). Evolution of views on the patriotic education of younger generation. *Journal of Advanced Pharmacy Education and Research*, 8(4), 56–61. <https://www.scopus.com/inward/record.uri?eid=2-s2.0-85063217390&partnerID=40&md5=6f7adffe2537b12b18c7a9b392195802>
- Ayad, O. (2022). Divine Unity in a Qaṣīda Lāmīyya (Ode Rhyming in Lām) of Abū Madyan al-Ghawth. *Journal of Islamic and Muslim Studies*, 7(1), 61–91. <https://doi.org/10.2979/jims.7.1.04>
- Bogart, G. (2018). Dreamwork and self-healing: Unfolding the symbols of the unconscious. In *Dreamwork and Self-Healing: Unfolding the Symbols of the Unconscious*. Taylor and Francis. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780429473999>
- Brown, A. (2020). Evincing the soul of a city. *Journal of Beliefs and Values*, 41(4), 433–445. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13617672.2020.1746877>
- Bryant, B. E. (2023). Epistemology. In *The Routledge Companion to John Wesley* (pp. 200–211). Taylor and Francis. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003037972-21>
- Bušková, M. (2021). Conversion as the path to the recovery of humanity in the context of St John Paul II's theology of holiness. *Acta Universitatis Carolinae Theologica*, 11(1), 109–128. <https://doi.org/10.14712/23363398.2021.6>
- Denapoli, A. (2018). Earning god through the “one-hundred rupee note”: Nirguṇa bhakti and religious experience among hindu renouncers in north India. *Religions*, 9(12). <https://doi.org/10.3390/REL9120408>
- Eckersley, R. (2019). Culture, health and well-being. In *The Social Origins of Health and Well-being* (pp. 51–70). Cambridge University Press. <https://doi.org/10.1017/9780511819599.005>
- Fabre, I. (2022). En estrange país: The nostalgia of Ideal in Marguerite Porete's work. *Romanica Cracoviensia*, 22(4), 335–343. <https://doi.org/10.4467/20843917RC.22.030.16195>
- Gharehbeygi, M., & Vasegh, M. (2018). Digression theory (Explanation of divergence in socio-political systems). *Geopolitics Quarterly*, 14(50), 173–189. <https://www.scopus.com/inward/record.uri?eid=2-s2.0-85066805570&partnerID=40&md5=e5bbb6536b2515025c5369fc308cfb7f>
-

-
- Greg, B. (2018). DREAMWORK AND SELF-HEALING: Unfolding the Symbols of the Unconscious. In *Dreamwork and Self-Healing: Unfolding the Symbols of the Unconscious*. Taylor and Francis. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780429473999>
- Gruberg, H., Dessein, J., D'Haese, M., Alba, E., & Benavides, J. P. (2022). Eroding Traditional Ecological Knowledge. A Case Study in Bolivia. *Human Ecology*, 50(6), 1047–1062. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10745-022-00375-9>
- Heinämaa, S., & Kaitaro, T. (2018). Descartes' notion of the mind-body union and its phenomenological expositions. In *The Oxford Handbook of the History of Phenomenology* (pp. 25–44). Oxford University Press. <https://doi.org/10.1093/oxfordhb/9780198755340.013.3>
- Kaunert, C., & de Deus Pereira, J. (2023). EU Eastern Partnership, Ontological Security and EU- Ukraine/Russian warfare. *Journal of Contemporary European Studies*, 31(4), 1135–1146. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14782804.2023.2183182>
- Kutáš, M. (2019). Cognitive science and spirituality. *Spirituality Studies*, 5(2), 36–43. <https://www.scopus.com/inward/record.uri?eid=2-s2.0-85075034303&partnerID=40&md5=2d0bcd867f8fd1fe847a440ba9308c1f>
- Matei, A. (2020). EUROPEAN UNION-MODEL OF GLOBAL INTEGRATION-IDENTITY THROUGH CULTURAL DIVERSITY. *Theoretical and Practical Research in the Economic Fields*, 11(2), 157–163. [https://doi.org/10.14505/tpref.v11.2\(22\).09](https://doi.org/10.14505/tpref.v11.2(22).09)
- Menassa, M., Stronks, K., Khatmi, F., Roa Díaz, Z. M., Espinola, O. P., Gamba, M., Itodo, O. A., Buttia, C., Wehrli, F., Minder, B., Velarde, M. R., & Franco, O. H. (2023). Concepts and definitions of healthy ageing: a systematic review and synthesis of theoretical models. *EClinicalMedicine*, 56. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eclinm.2022.101821>
- Nompumelelo, M., Gomo, E., Gqaleni, N., & Ngcobo, M. (2019). Core competencies acquired in indigenous training of traditional health practitioners in Kwazulu-Natal. *African Health Sciences*, 19(4), 3100–3106. <https://doi.org/10.4314/ahs.v19i4.32>
- Perlmutter, J. (2019). Desiring God implicitly: “Worldly union desires” and openness to God. *Religious Studies*, 55(3), 419–428. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0034412518000513>
- Pettifer, J. (2020). Dimitri Obolensky after the Cold War: Reflections on Saint Vladimir and Orthodoxy. *Vestnik Sankt-Peterburgskogo Universiteta, Istoriya*, 65(4), 1231–1244. <https://doi.org/10.21638/11701/SPBU02.2020.413>
- Plested, M. (2024). Deification in Macarius, Evagrius, and Dionysius. In *The Oxford Handbook of Deification* (pp. 123–136). Oxford University Press. <https://doi.org/10.1093/oxfordhb/9780198865179.013.10>
- Polanía, E. F. V., Iles, A. B., Arévalo, S. A. T., & Rodríguez, Y. E. C. (2022). Existing from Relationality; educations in the experience of Andean-Amazonian knowledge of living from the heart of the Nasa and Coreguaje peoples of Colombia. *Estudios Pedagógicos*, 48(2), 435–449. <https://doi.org/10.4067/S0718-07052022000200435>
- Saraceno, L. (2020). «Eunuchs for the Heavenly Kingdom». *Quaderni di Storia Religiosa Medievale*, 2020(1), 7–24. <https://doi.org/10.32052/97577>
- Shubitidze, V., & Japharidze, E. (2021). EUROPEAN VALUES AND GEORGIAN POLITICAL THINKING. *Evropsky Politicky a Pravni Diskurz*, 8(1), 114–121. <https://doi.org/10.46340/eppd.2021.8.1.14>
- Simonyan, R. H., & Slutskin, L. N. (2020). Comparative analysis of students' collective consciousness in the Russia-EU and Russia-China border regions: Mathematical modelling. *Baltic Region*, 12(2), 40–53. <https://doi.org/10.5922/2079-8555-2020-2-3>
-

-
- Sinha, M. (2022). Consciousness in Yoga for the Transformation of Human Potentiality. In C. D., K. S., & S. U.R. (Eds.), *Lecture Notes in Networks and Systems* (Vol. 391, pp. 497–509). Springer Science and Business Media Deutschland GmbH. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-94277-9_43
- Stauffer, R. (2024). Critical Pedagogy and Teaching Russian Folklore. *Folklorica*, 28, 28–47. <https://doi.org/10.17161/folklorica.v28i.23112>
- Ugwu, I. P. (2024). Environmental Protection, Rights of Nature, and Religious Beliefs in Europe. *International Journal for the Semiotics of Law*. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11196-024-10193-5>
- Usmanova, A. A., Kosimova, D. X., & Abduraimova, B. B. (2020). Estimated attitude of students to cultural and leisure activities at the university. *International Journal of Psychosocial Rehabilitation*, 24(3), 268–281. <https://doi.org/10.37200/IJPR/V24I3/PR200779>
- Villegas, D. L. (2021). Examining catherine of Siena's controversial discernments about papal politics. *HTS Theologiese Studies / Theological Studies*, 77(2). <https://doi.org/10.4102/hts.v77i2.6654>
- Voloshina, V. (2021). Congresses of russian academic organizations abroad on the problems of preserving the historical memory of the russian diaspora. *Istoriya*, 12(2). <https://doi.org/10.18254/S207987840014158-2>
- Witkowska-Chrzczonowicz, K. (2021). European Integration in the teachings of John Paul II: Selected aspects. *Studia Iuridica Toruniensia*, 29, 459–470. <https://doi.org/10.12775/SIT.2021.042>
-

Copyright Holder :

© Yogi Fery Hidayat et al. (2024).

First Publication Right :

© Journal of Noesantara Islamic Studies

This article is under:

